



YOUTH PARLIAMENT PAKISTAN  
Third Session  
**Official Debates**  
Thursday, July 4, 2013

The Youth Parliament met in the Margalla Hotel, Islamabad at eleven o'clock in the morning with Madam Deputy Speaker (Miss Aseela Shamim Haq) in the Chair.

-----  
*(Recitation of the Holy Quran)*  
-----

Madam Deputy Speaker: Now we take agenda item No.2. Ms. Sitwat Waqar, Youth Shadow Minister for Foreign Affairs and Defence and Ms. Momna Naeem, Chairperson Standing Committee for Information would like to present a policy on revisiting Pakistan's relations with India. Miss Sitwat Waqar.

Ms. Sitwat Waqar: Thank you Madam Speaker. This is a report on India-Pakistan relations. Since we have the new Government elected recently, we decided to present a policy on what Pakistan's foreign policy should be towards India. It talks about a few confidence building measures.

The report is basically divided into two parts. The first is about what Pakistan's foreign policy should be towards India including what confidence building measures we should have and how we should go about them. It is written by me and Kashif Shaikh.

The second part is about resolving the Kashmir issue because we believe that Kashmir issue can only be resolved once the both countries agree on few things. There are some mutual agreements between the two countries. So, the second part will be presented by Momna. I have the summary which is being printed, it has the bullet points.

Madam Deputy Speaker: Alright, Miss Momna.

Ms. Momna Naeem: I begin with the name of Allah. The first part of the report introduced by Sitwat is about India and Pakistan's current political issues. The second part is about Pakistan and India's peace process on Kashmir issue.

The first part of report is about the history of Kashmir issue. When initially given a choice between Pakistan and India in October 1947, the governing prince of the Kashmir favoured India while the people of Kashmir wanted to stay with Pakistan or Mr. Muhammad Ali

Jinnah. The Kashmir issue basically started in October 1947 and it rose in 1948 when Pakistani soldiers faced Indian troops in the first Kashmir War invading from the north-west of Kashmir Region.

In 1961 another war was fought between Pakistan and India to gain the control of Kashmir's territory. Conflict took place between India and Pakistan in Kargil District of Kashmir where the main aim was to cut the connections between National Highway No.1 and Laddakh which is a region of Kashmir in order to make the Indian forces retreat from the Siachin Glacier.

After this war, there have been several other issues on the borders of Pakistan and India which rose the Kashmir issue. After that, the report states that despite continued militant attacks, both nations eventually attempted to reach peaceful negotiations over the border disputes including the establishment of supporting ties, transportation links, CBMs, official ceasefire arrangements and recognition of Kashmir separatist groups by India.

My report also states the approach of both countries towards the Kashmir issue. The first approach stated is the Indian approach. India has been blaming Pakistan for illegally controlling the Azad Kashmir and calls it as Pakistani occupied Kashmir. As far the Pakistani's approach, we are of the opinion that the future status of Jammu & Kashmir should aim to rescue the right of self-determination of Kashmiri people and their right is a free, fair and internationally supervised voting which will offer the people of Kashmir the choice of permanent assistance to either Pakistan or India.

On January 6, 2004, Mr. Pervez Musharraf, President of Pakistan started peace process with India on Kashmir dispute. These peace processes stopped due to the regime changes in Pakistan and Mumbai attacks of 26<sup>th</sup> November, 2008.

Now, my report gives some recommendations about the major processes which may provide an alternative for peace and conflict resolution, peace in Jammu and Kashmir which are as follows:

1. Process of dialogues which would be held between both the countries, nations, Prime Ministers or whoever the leaders are.
2. The process of constructive cooperation. Cooperation between the nations over the borders which have been a place of continuous war.
3. Process of constructive settlement.

4. Process of protecting minority rights in Indian and Pakistani controlled Jammu and Kashmir.
5. Process of regional autonomy in Indian and Pakistani controlled Jammu and Kashmir.
6. Process of healing wounds through compensation, the wounds of people living in Azad Jammu and Kashmir or Occupied Jammu and Kashmir.
7. Process of socio-economic uplift of people through better education, health, employment and other basic facilities. In order to provide them a better life style, Pakistanis can offer such facilities to them.
8. Process of mutual tolerance.
9. Process of neutralizing hard-line elements.
10. Process of creating a constituency of peace.
11. Process of creating awareness about conflict resolution, problems and changes in creating an alternate architecture for C.R. process and methodology to unleash the process.

This was the second part of the report done by me. Now Sitwat Waqar will proceed further.

Madam Deputy Speaker: Ms. Sitwat Waqar *sahiba*.

Ms. Sitwat Waqar: For the first part which basically talks about confidence building measures, the need for such measures right now is also important because after the 9/11 scenario, the South Asia has changed immensely. We don't know what might happen after United States withdraws in 2014. This could actually mean that perhaps some Jihadis could enter Pakistan and go towards the Kashmir area which can possibly result in India coming into the Kashmir and probably that could lead to another violence and also seeing that both the countries are nuclear powers. This means that there could be a threat of a nuclear war. So, this is high time that we try to resolve the Kashmir issue but obviously, we are not going to start with the Kashmir issue, we will start with other confidence building measures.

The incumbent Government of Mian Nawaz Sharif right now is talking about improving the trade relations with India as well as visa liberalization. So, I will basically be shedding light on that.

Let us talk about trade liberalization. That is basically the best confidence building measure that any country can start from. All countries want to have economic power and it is in their national interest to increase their economic power. The best solution for India and Pakistan is to start from a system of an economic inter-dependence. Both have signed the SAFTA in the last decade and they have been working on that. Our report shows that India only constitutes 1.2% of Pakistan's exports, however, Pakistan only constitutes 0.9% of India's exports. A report by Chamber of Commerce and Industry shows that exports of India to Pakistan are five times larger than the Pakistani exports to India. India has a larger market and obviously it has a much larger population as compared to Pakistan. That actually leads towards trade deficit for Pakistan. Pakistan's economy is much smaller and the Indian exports have constituted on Soybeans, newsprints and other things. There is a huge list, because of shortage of time, I am not going to read out. The volume of Indian exports is around Rs.50 billion, whereas, Pakistan has only been able to export goods worth Rs.9 billion. So, you can imagine that there is a difference of Rs.41 billion. That is how much India is profiting of trade with Pakistan while Pakistan is not profiting as much.

There have been reports which show that due to the problems of international trade, Pakistan's products are obviously not given much precedence. However, when Pakistan gets to trade with India, its export business obviously has some advantages because we are natural trading partners, because we are neighbours. It does go in the interest of Pakistan.

However, what I believe Pakistan should make sure normalizing the trade balance with India. E.g. Pakistan's trade policy with India should be such that Pakistan's agriculture sector, pharmaceutical industry and the garment manufacturing do not suffer. There is a fear in these industries that Indian exports are going to swamp our market and our industrial sector will suffer because obviously, another issue with Pakistan is that our imports don't have high taxes placed on them. So, imports usually like Chinese goods are much cheaper than our local products and people prefer to buy imported goods as compared to our local products. This can put our industrial sector at a disadvantage. There are certain policies I am not going to go over them that Pakistan should keep in mind. I think an email has been sent to all the members last night if you want to have a look at the detailed report.

Another confidence building measure that we could look at is the relaxing of visa regime. Actually, an agreement was signed between India and Pakistan in September 2012. Due to some

cross border infiltration and some terrorist attacks happening, this was going to be operationalized in December 2012. It was postponed till January 2013 of this year by India because of those issues. There are also other issues with this visa liberalization as of this moment right now. It is because of the wide spread terrorist activity that is going on in Pakistan, also the insurgency happening in Balochistan and a lot of involvement of the foreign hand in addition to the Afghan War going on. At this point, talking about this confidence building measure may not be that prudent because obviously, we have to make sure that to tighten our security within our country and only then we can start towards this confidence building measure.

Another confidence building measure which would actually be very beneficial for both countries' development is some sort of research, academic and cultural exchange. We already know some cultural exchange is already going on and I will be talking about that shortly because it had an adverse effect on the Pakistani society. However, if there is some research and academic exchange between the two countries such as more academic conferences being held, some sort of student exchange programs, academic exchanges, some sort of joint ventures between the two countries in information technology and other technological advances e.g. the car manufacturing industry in India is very strong and also they are very high in hospitality business. They are also very good at theme park, Pakistan does not really have any theme park at the moment but if we have some joint venture and some investment then both the countries can benefit from traders and tourists. Elderly people, e.g. want to meet relatives in each other's countries, India and Pakistan. A lot of that could happen if we move towards that.

If you look at the cultural exchange, Pakistan has not been able to promote its culture in India. However, India has been promoting its Bollywood films and has been profiting a lot from our audience. That has actually had a very adverse effect on Pakistani people. The younger generation has been mixing words of Urdu and Hindi, they are adopting the traditions of Indian marriages and they are very much followed in Pakistan. That actually has an adverse effect on our cultural heritage, our own cultural beliefs and our own history, our vision, our ideology, and what we are as a nation.

There are few other miscellaneous confidence building measures but however the point is that now is the best time to talk about building good diplomatic relations with India. Now when Pakistan is already in such a precarious situation and we already have a very porous western border, we cannot afford that on the western border as well. Pakistan is already putting too much

money into its defence spending. It is already economically bankrupt. We really have to revise our foreign policy towards our neighbouring countries especially India because it is considered as our enemy, I mean that is what we have been calling this country. It is time that we actually move towards these confidence building measures, starting from trade liberalization to some intellectual getting-together so that at some time in the future, in the coming decades, we can move towards resolution of the Kashmir issue as outlined by Momna's part of the report.

I would also like to say that in the last session as well, we presented a policy on Pak-Iran relations. It is never the opposition that presents policies but we have done it. I have not really heard from their Foreign Minister yet if they have worked on the Iran-Pakistan Gas Pipeline project. It is also in third session, our report on India Pakistan already doing is proposing some policies. The real part actually has to be done by the Government. So, we are looking forward to some response from them.

Madam Deputy Speaker: Honourable Foreign Minister *sahiba*, would you like to comment now or do you need some time to prepare?

Honourable YP Foreign Minister: Thank you honourable Speaker. In the last session, in my absence, two of my fellow parliamentarians, Rafay and Yasir, worked on Pak-Iran policy. They would get back to the honourable Shadow Minister as soon as possible. Whereas, her policy statement on India is concerned, I believe that she is taking India a bit too lightly.

Madam Deputy Speaker: Do you want to comment on her policy? If you have view of your own, a policy statement of your own?

Honourable YP Foreign Minister: I want to comment on her policy.

Madam Deputy Speaker: I don't think that is admissible. Whenever you have some views or a policy statement of your own, I am giving you the time so that you can prepare one.

We have received a motion that requires our immediate attention. No confidence motion has been filed by the Blue Party and they wish to express that they no longer have confidence in their party leader. Now, I would read out the motion:

"The House is of the opinion that the Prime Minister no more enjoys the support of the majority members in the House. Therefore, we are moving a vote of no confidence motion against the Prime Minister. The names, YP numbers and signatures of the members supporting the motion are as follows....."

Now, I would like some of the members who signed the motion to reaffirm their signatures so that there is no ambiguity.

*(The Members who signed the motion rose on their seats and identified themselves)*

Madam Deputy Speaker: Because of this motion of high importance, we will hold the agenda for now and move on to the motion. All those in favour of the motion may raise their hands.

*(At this moment count was made)*

Madam Deputy Speaker: The votes have been counted, 25 of the members were in favour of the motion while 23 were required for the motion to be successful. Therefore, I think from the show of hands, it is fairly evident that the Prime Minister no longer holds the confidence of her party and rest of the House. I request the Secretariat to convene a meeting and hold elections for the Leader of the House as soon as possible.

Until we have a new Leader of the House, the House is adjourned till 9:30 am tomorrow.

-----

*[The House was then adjourned to meet again on Friday, the July 5, 2013 at 9:30 am]*

-----